Shifting Grounds
Identity Politics and
Sydney's Ethnic Clubs

Dijana Alić

University of New South Wales

Metropolitan Sydney is home to a diverse range of migrants, who, over time, have built their clubs, religious buildings and other structures to facilitate community gatherings, interaction and celebrations. This paper explores the complex relationship between migrant groups and the architecture of ethnic community buildings. It considers such cultural buildings as important mediators between migrant groups, their cultures of origin and their identities in their adopted country. It also considers the architectural expression of ethnic community buildings in relation to the political and cultural contexts in which the buildings emerged. It argues that the range of architectural expression and the urban locations of ethnic clubs reflect the ambiguous and changing roles that migrant groups play in multicultural Australia. The gradual move of community clubs from the city centre to suburbs and then to the city's outer edge demonstrates the changing needs of ethnic communities as well as the social transformations of the Australian society.

Early Infrastructure for Migrant Communities

Sydney has a long history of providing infrastructure to its diverse groups of immigrants. Walter F. Lalich presents evidence of extensive community infrastructure developed in Sydney between 1809 and 1941.[1] His study shows, for example, that in the city area alone between about 1825 and 1882 six religious institutions were built: four Christian churches of various denomination and two Jewish synagogues.[2] In the period to 1942, more than 13 churches, six synagogues and three temples, representing various faiths, and about six clubs were built to facilitate social gatherings for the Germans, Chinese, Italians, Maltese and Jewish people living in Sydney. This tilt towards building religious infrastructure rather than community facilities

1. Walter F. Lalich, "Ethnic Community Capital: The Development of Ethnic Social Infrastructure in Sydney," PhD diss.,University of Technology, Sydney, 2003), 143.

2. Lalich, "Ethnic Community Capital," 143

indicates that religion, at the time, was a form of social organisation of greater importance than other community associations. The promotion of religious infrastructure also assimilated immigrants into existing religious organisations, and by extension provided for a more homogenous society.[3] Although on a smaller scale than the religious institutions, a number of community clubs opened in the early twentiethc-century. They represented endeavours to provide spaces for social gatherings and alternative forms of community engagement.

This paper considers the role of ethnic clubs in representing their communities and it links the clubs with the wider social and political context. The discussion traces the changes in clubs as well as shifting relationships between community clubs and broader urban society in post-war Sydney, particularly between the 1950s and 1970s. It presents a historic and cultural review of select clubs in the Sydney metropolitan area. While the discussion focuses on private enterprises, it prioritises social over commercial agendas. The paper argues for a relationship between the club locations within the urban and suburban context and the shifting and changing notions of Australian identity. Further, in relation to the ethnic clubs' contribution to build fabric, the paper demonstrates that while immigrant groups were called to contribute to building their new country, political and aesthetic demands moderated their contributions.

A New Form: Establishing Ethnic Clubs

Although religious institutions dominated early development of ethnic infrastructure, other facilities supporting social gatherings of Sydney's growing migrant communities were being established. Commonly, social gatherings took place in purchased or hired halls or in like places suitable for large gatherings. Such was the case for the Concordia German club, established in 1883 and one of the earliest clubs in Sydney.[4] The club acquired an existing property bounded by Elizabeth, Nithsdale, Goulbourn and Liverpool Streets, and erected a hall and club premises on the site by 1905 (figure 1).[5] In subsequent years the club changed location, and it eventually closed in 1915.[6] The commencement of World War One in Europe heightened government concerns about German institutions in Australia, and this led to the destruction of communal migrant property and enforced name changes to 90 places established by German

3. With the passing of the 1901 Immigration Restriction Act, which underpinned the White Australia policy, the diversity of people moving to Australia was severely restricted.

4. Lalich, Ethnic Community Capital, 142–43. The club operated at various locations, including in Phillip Street, Sydney, c. 1900–10; it is currently located in the suburb of Tempe.

5. The land was originally part of two grants: the Elizabeth Street property and the Nithsdale Street portion. Due to the outbreak of the plague, city authorities widened the street and relocated the club at an adjacent address, 150–52 Elizabeth Street. According to the Dictionary of Sydney, the new owners constructed the "Australia Hall" in 1920s. They sold the building in 1979 to the Hellenic Club, and Greek Cypriots used it as the Cyprus-Hellene Club. Dictionary of Sydney, 2008. Information about the building located at 150–52 Elizabeth Street, Sydney is also available on NSW Government Environment and Heritage website, under Cyprus-Hellene Club. http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/heritageapp/ViewHeritageItemDetails.aspx?ID=5045005 (accessed January 4, 2013).

6. http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/heritageapp/ViewHeritageItemDetails.aspx?ID=5045005 (accessed July 4, 2012).

Figure 1. Cyprus-Hellene Club (formerly used by the Concordia Club). Photograph by the author.

7. Lalich, "Ethnic Community Capital," 140.

8. Lalich, "Ethnic Community Capital," 141.

9. Lalich, "Ethnic Community Capital," 141. Lalich suggests that intra-communal cultural and linguistic differences continued to expand in many communities, including the Jewish community.

10. Lalich, "Ethnic Community Capital," 141.

11. Lalich, "Ethnic Community Capital," 141.

12. *Immigration Nation*, SBS documentary, and http://www.sbs.com.au/immigrationnation/resources/article/176/populate-or-perish

13. "Immigration: Federation to Century's End," prepared by the Statistics Section, Business Branch, Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Commonwealth of Australia 2001, 4. The arrival of troops returning from World War One in 1919 also resulted in a large number of people entering Australia. The number of immigrants fluctuated post-World War Two, with net immigration declining following 1950's peak.

14. "Immigration: Federation to Century's End," 4.

settlers.[7] Anticipating the destruction of their property at the beginning of World War Two, many German migrant organisations willingly handed over their facilities to the government. One such example was a Lutheran Church, which transformed into an "Australian church."[8]

According to Lalich, the infrastructure built for ethnic communities in the interwar period was unable to meet the needs of the increasingly diverse ethnic groups arriving in Australia.[9] A 1936 royal commission into urban settlement found that major Australian cities did not provide adequate public spaces for its inhabitants.[10] The lack of social space presented opportunities for migrants to develop their own informal and formal organisational networks. The development of such public premises became a mode of community organisation.[11]

The end of World War Two marked a starting point of an ambitious post-war rebuilding program in Australia. The federal government established the Department of Immigration and it embarked on bold plans to increase Australia's population at a rate of one per cent annually.[12] Department of Immigration records from 1901 to 2000 show that 1950 was the year net migration from overseas soared to 150,000 people, a number only surpassed by a substantial peak in 1988.[13] Although migration numbers fluctuated in the following years, the 1950s marked significant changes in Australian immigration.[14] The increase in migrants was aimed at establishing a balance between assisted and non-assisted migrants, as well as between migrants of British and non-British backgrounds. The shift towards greater

inclusion of non-British migrants saw numerous inter- governmental treaties and agreements aimed at assisting the arrival of new migrants. The post-war resettlement programs accommodated migrants from various European countries, including Greece, Hungary, Italy, Malta, Poland and Yugoslavia.[15] These new migrant communities needed facilities to support their social and cultural integration into Australian society.

In political terms, the post-war period was marked by government promotion of a homogeneous Australian society. The concept of national identity was based upon "supposedly shared British roots of the bulk of the population."[16] Paradoxically, the study *Mistaken Identity, Multiculturalism and the Demise of Nationalism in Australia* argues, the doctrine of assimilation simultaneously reinforced "the sense of homogeneity and the sense of superiority of the Anglophone population."[17] The expectation that migrants assimilate to a uniform "Australian" culture concealed internal differences linked to class, gender and religion, as well as the relationship to Australia's indigenous culture.[18] In relation to migrants, the expectation that such a large number of people could assimilate to the "point of invisibility" was problematic.[19] Their right to difference and to express their culture seemed primarily focused on, if not limited to, "food, language and dress."[20]

Inner-city Clubs as Social Places

From 1950s, a number of clubs opened in existing city premises. The predominance of male over female migrants increased the need for restaurants and after-work enjoyment. As a consequence, community clubs became focused on providing food and entertainment. Not far from the German club mentioned earlier, Sydney's Spanish population established its own club on Liverpool Street in 1961.[21] From its early days the club promoted Spanish dances and the study of language, drawing on the support of a wider audience. The club's prominent and central location provided easy access, which facilitated its development into an important centre of public life.[22] The Lebanese Club was not dissimilar, opening in August 1953 near the Strawberry Hills post office in the inner-city suburb of Redfern. Reporting on the newly opened club, the magazine Hotel and Café News stated: "More than 3,000 people gathered in Cleveland Street, Redfern, for the opening of the Lebanese Club and Restaurant

15. "Immigration: Federation to Century's End," 17.

16. S. Castles, M. Kalamtzis, B. Cope and M. Morrissey, *Mistaken Identity: Multiculturalism and the Demise of Nationalism in Australia*, (London: Pluto Press, 1988), section "Assimilation to Integration 1945–1972," 243-56.

17. Castles, Kalamtzis, Cope, Morrissey, *Mistaken Identity*, 45.

18. Castles, Kalamtzis, Cope, Morrissey, *Mistaken Identity*, 45.

19. Castles, Kalamtzis, Cope, Morrissey, *Mistaken Identity*, 45.

20. Castles, Kalamtzis, Cope, Morrissey, *Mistaken Identity*, 44.

21. http://scratchingsydneyssurface. wordpress.com/2011/06/24/24-june-2011-hola-spanish-sydney/ (accessed January 4, 2013.

22. According to the article "Hola Spanish Sydney," the club was donated to the community by multi-millionaire shipping tycoon R.D. De Lasala.

early this month. Only 1,000 were able to gain admission, but the crowd was indicative of the way in which the Club caught Sydney's imagination."[23]

The review suggested the club's cooking was one of its main features. Its two restaurants were open to "Australians, as well as Lebanese" and served Lebanese, French and English dishes.[24] Hotel and Café News observed that in renovating the two-storey building, "the proprietors have missed scarcely a square inch," with the spaces "entirely redecorated and repainted, inside and out."[25] Complementing the club for the interior colour schemes, finishes and lighting, the article then quoted the manager: "without doubt, [the club offered] the most modern restaurant in Australia."[26] The interior murals presented the Cedar of Lebanon as the central motif and were described as "colourful handcarved murals of modernistic design."[27] The images in the club's interior came "from the heraldic devices of Lebanon," connecting the distant homeland to the suburban interiors of Sydney.[28] The club's importance appears to have been its commercial success in presenting authentic Lebanese food to a wide audience and in providing a venue for private gatherings for men of the Lebanese community.

Anthropologist and social theorist Ghassan Hage has argued that the opening of such clubs and eateries enabled "the basis of home-building in the public sphere" and fostered forms of recreation or "intimations" of homely communality.[29] Describing the role ethnic clubs played, he writes: "As each wave of immigrants settled in, little knots of eateries, evocative of the old world, served as meeting places where lonely groups of migrants chatted in their native tongue and recreated the tastes of home."[30] An increasing number of ethnic clubs and eateries opened in Sydney through the 1950s and 1960s, but they appear to have catered primarily for the entertainment of men, and only occasionally for families and the wider community.

Another article in *Hotel and Café News*, published in June 1960, described the newly opened Hellenic Club's highly desirable location by Hyde Park as "the only extensive verdant breathtaking spot in the very heart of the city."[31] The club's membership, the article continued, included both Greeks and Australians and confirmed the values of the "classic Greek" model of democracy. As was the case with the Lebanese Club, references to culture were made via the interior murals. These depicted the "Greek Australian outlook of the club" by "linking classic

24. "The Lebanese Club," 21.

23. "The Lebanese Club: Sydney's Newest Night Spot," *Hotel and Café News*, August 1953, 19–21.

25. "The Lebanese Club," 19.

26. "The Lebanese Club," 19.
27. "The Lebanese Club," 19.

28. "The Lebanese Club," 21.

29. Ghassan Hage, "At Home in the Entrails of the West: Multiculturalism, Ethnic Food and Migrant Home Building", in ed. *Home/World, Space, Community and Marginality in Sydney's West*, (London: Pluto Press, 1997), 111.

30. Hage, "At Home in the Entrails of the West," 111, a quote from an article published in Sydney Morning Herald.

31. "Luxury Hellenic Club," *Hotel and Café News*, June 1960, 20–21.

Greek myth and legend with the contemporary scene and with Australian tradition and outdoor life."[32] A map of Greece and its islands, the traditional "trident of the seagod," fishing boats, the Olympic torch and classical buildings were described as counterbalanced by pictures of Australia that include a "leaping kangaroo," a bronzed surf skier and tropical fish. An adjoining mural compared Greek and Australian horsemanship, highlighting the club's aspirations to build on the common links between Australian and Greek ways of life.[33]

This desire to identify and build upon commonalities was also evident in the interiors of the Italian—Australian All Sports Association (APIA)[34] club in Sydney. According to the Hotel and Café News, upon entering the building the visitor was faced with the "marbled magnificence of its impressive portico."[35] The interior murals depicted architectural wonders from famous cities in Italy—including the Venetian Palace of the Doge, the Coliseum of Rome and Pisa's tower—against a background of the Italian Alps.[36] The APIA's modern interiors, embellished by murals depicting lands far away, followed similar themes to those of the Lebanese and Greek clubs.

The production and promotion of ethnic food is commonly seen as the most authentic contribution of an ethnic club to the broader community. Ghassan Hage has argued that the availability of ethnic restaurants underpins an understanding of multicultural Australia.[37] Multiculturalism, he says, has been defined by the "availability of ethnic restaurants for cosmopolitan consumers rather than on the basis of ethnic food centred migrant home-building."[38] While the concept of multicultural Australia was officially introduced into public discourse in the late 1970s, early ethnic clubs arguably contributed to the connection between ethnicity and consumption.

Suburban Life: Aiding Assimilation

Despite APIA's similarity to other clubs in the way its interiors visually linked its ethnic culture and broader Australian culture, the club marked a significant shift in the way the clubs operated. It was a family club, not just a gentlemen's club or a restaurant. APIA was not located in the inner city but in the suburb of Leichhardt, where its purpose-built facility was surrounded by ample parking. It catered for diverse experiences,

32. "Luxury Hellenic Club," 21.

33. "Luxury Hellenic Club," 21.

34. Associazione Polisportiva Italo–Australiana (Italian–Australian All Sports Association).

35. "Apia Club (Sydney) is Cultural, Social and Sporting," *Hotel, Motel and Restaurant*, June 1965, 14.

36. "Apia Club (Sydney) is Cultural, Social and Sporting," 15. Alitalia donated the murals.

37. Hage, "At Home in the Entrails of the West," 99–154.

38. Hage, "At Home in the Entrails of the West," 100.

engaging the whole family. Of the two floors operating in 1965, one was dedicated to dining and entertainment; the other was devoted to sport and a food-serving area. Bar service in the latter was informal, aimed at "members coming straight from work," "not dressed to conform with the standards required of the main floor."[39] The club's "feature" of most prominence was its Italian bowls alley. The article "Apia Club (Sydney) is Cultural, Social and Sporting" described the game as "extremely popular amongst Italians of all ages" and with an "enthusiastic following." The club also catered for "Australian sports," which included table tennis, tables with soccer games, rebound pool and indoor bowls.[40] According to the Hotel, Motel and Restaurant review, the APIA club played a "real part in the day to day lives of its members."[41]

While membership appears to have been open to non-Italians, services such as a travel agency and a bank branch suggest Italian migrants were the primary audience.

A suburban location allowed clubs to diversify their services and focus on community needs. Club Marconi at Bossley Park was established in 1956, as a result of the increasing social involvement of Sydney's Italian migrants.[42] The land was affordable in the outer suburbs, and Club Marconi was able to build its own facilities (figure 2).[43] The original building was constructed in 1958, and soon after, in October 1960, architect Cavalier was commissioned to submit plans for an extension of the building.[44] Community members, who guaranteed the loan against their own homes, financed the building through their generous contributions.[45]

Through a series of expansions in 1960s and 1970s, adjacent blocks of land were included in the complex. Titled "The dream of tomorrow," the Club Marconi master plan showed expansive club facilities: soccer fields, bowling and picnic grounds, and

39. "Apia Club (Sydney) is Cultural, Social and Sporting," 14.

40. "Apia Club (Sydney) is Cultural, Social and Sporting," 23.

41. "Apia Club (Sydney) is Cultural, Social and Sporting," 23.

42. Diane Powell (Diane Leslie), *Club Marconi 50th Anniversary 2008* (Sydney: Bounce Books, 2008) and Deepika Ratnaraj, "Precedent Study: Club Marconi," *Dictionary of Sydney* article, graduation studio, UNSW, 2012.

43. 121–33 Prairie Vale Road, Bossley Park, NSW 2176, http://clubmarconi.com.au/

44. Ratnaraj, "Precedent Study: Club Marconi," and Powell, *Club Marconi 50th Anniversary 2008*.

45. Powell, *Club Marconi 50th Anniversary 2008*, 127–36.

Figure 2. Club Marconi at Bossley Park recreation centre today. Courtesy Deepika Ratnaraj

open landscaped surrounds. The club's close relationship with and support of the Marconi Stallion premier football team, along with the provision of sports fields, provided for the integration of Club Marconi into the suburban context.[46] The club grew into one of the largest and most prominent buildings in Bossley Park.[47] In recognition of its importance, Fairfield Council renamed Middle Road Marconi Road in 1966.[48]

Increasingly diverse facilities in the club provided for a greater breath of community engagement. Numerous images of the Marconi's "Ladies' Auxiliaries" present women engaging in various ways with the club. Although most commonly associated with organising "mother's night" and "ladies' night," the women played a significant role in running the club. Pictures also show women in formal gowns, enjoying the evenings and actively participating in club functions. Sporting facilities enabled children and youth to integrate through the daily activities of the club. The club also facilitated social integration of children through Christmas parties and like functions.[49] Marconi's promotion of modern ideals of leisure, recreation and community involvement contributed to its easy incorporation into the suburban context.

Marking Diversity

A significant shift in the development of ethnic community infrastructure came on a back of political and social changes in the late 1960s and the 1970s, and with the emergence of "ethnic politics." Ethnic politics developed out of what has been described as the "sheer weight of non- English-speaking migrant numbers and their relative social disadvantage."[50] Non-English-speaking communities saw that factors such as prejudice and a lack of recognition of overseas qualifications posed barriers to migrants' social and economic advancement. Government polices responded to the push for recognition of social and cultural diversity within Australian society.

The establishment of the Ethnic Community Council of New South Wales in 1974 in many ways facilitated the transformation of ethnic groups into "ethnic communities" with "leaders."[51] The publication of Galbally Report,[52] commissioned by Prime Minister Fraser in 1977, furthered the notion of internal cohe-

46. http://clubmarconi.com.au/about-us/club-history/

47. Ratnaraj, "Precedent Study: Club Marconi," and Club Marconi website, http://clubmarconi.com.au/about-the-club.html; viewed 9 March 2012. Today, Club Marconi employs more than 200 staff, and has more than 25,000 members of 18 different nationalities speaking 24 languages, making it the most cosmopolitan club in Australia.

48. Ratnaraj, "Precedent Study: Club Marconi."

49. Powell, *Club Marconi 50th Anniversary 2008*, 115.

50. Castles, Kalamtzis, Cope, Morrissey, *Mistaken Identity*, 120.

51. Castles, Kalamtzis, Cope, Morrissey, *Mistaken Identity*, 62

52. http://www.multiculturalaustralia.edu.au/library/media/Timeline-Commentary/id/107. The- Galbally-Strategy-for-migrant-settlement; viewed 10 December 2012.

sion of ethnic communities and the need for their self-reliance. The report argued that the government's role was to make migrants more welcome and to provide facilities that would ensure migrants had the same rights and access to services as other Australians. The Galbally Report presented 57 recommendations that involved expenditure of $50 million over three years. It included the extension of grant-in-aid programs to ethnic community organisations and the establishment of migrant resource centres.[53]

53. http://www.multiculturalaustralia.edu.au/library/media/Timeline-Commentary/id/107. The- Galbally-Strategy-for-migrant-settlement.

Figure 3. (Google Maps). Bantry Bay

54. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bantry_Bay_(New_South_Wales)

55. Laura Parengkuan, "Dutch Australian Society Neerlandia (Das Neerlandia) ," graduation studio, UNSW, 2012. The clubhouse, designed by Mr Brandt and completed in 1978, is located on the corner of Grattan Crescent and Bantry Bay Road, Frenchs Forest.

56. Mijntje Hage, *Fifty Years: The Story of the Dutch Australian Society "Neerlandia,"* (Sydney: DAS Neerlandia), 2004, 48–49, cited in Parengkuan, "Dutch Australian Society Neerlandia."

57. M. Hage, *Fifty Years: The Story of the Dutch Australian Society "Neerlandia,"* DAS Neerlandia, Sydney, 2004, 53, quoted in Parengkuan, "Dutch Australian Society Neerlandia."

In 1975, as a result of these changes, the New South Wales' Minister for Community Services and Health set aside crown land for community clubs. The area of Bantry Bay, on the fringes of Sydney's northern suburbs, was identified as appropriate. Used until 1973 for storage of explosives, the Bantry Bay area was desolate.[54] The government's offer to clubs was to "occupy and rent an acre of that land."[55] The Austrians, Czecho-Slovakians, Scandinavians, Armenians and Dutch Neerlandia Society were among those to take up the offer.[56]

Land was officially conveyed to the Dutch Australian Neerlandia Society in 1976, and the following year a new clubhouse was opened. It was a simple brick building, which, due to a limited budget, was primarily constructed by the community.[57] It was set back from the street in a manner typical of residential development, and the private, small-scale front elevation was enclosed, so presented limited interaction with the street. Isolated and enclosed, the Neerlandia clubhouse appeared much like a residential dwelling and it only occasionally opened its grounds to the wider public.

The Czech Sokol club presented a more public front,[58] and was built only a few blocks away from the Neerlandia clubhouse. Larger in scale, the complex includes a gymnasium, library, dining hall, recreation room and multi-functional space, its interiors embellished with traditional Czech symbols and decoration.[59] The existing gymnasium, which formerly accommodated the Sokol practice of gymnastics, is currently a multi-functional sports gym, hosting community "futsal" competitions. The integration of sport in its facilities made the Sokol club accessible to other communities; however, its relatively isolated position has meant the club and its activities have catered primarily for the needs of the Czechoslovakian community.

Focused on promoting difference and ethnic specificity, the clubs such as the Nineveh, built by the Assyrian community, openly questioned the need to assimilate in the existing built fabric and cultural context.[60] The Assyrians are an ancient people that have no nation state or homeland.[61] The club's name, Nineveh, is a

58. Sokol Sydney Limited, 16 Grattan Crescent, Frenchs Forest, NSW 2086.

59. Reid Nakou, "Precedent Study: Sokol Club," graduation studio, UNSW, 2012.

60. Located on Lot 115 Smithfield Road, Bonnyrigg (presently known as 673–83 Smithfield Road, Edensor Park).

61. Deepika Ratnaraj, "Precedent Study 2: Nineveh Club," graduation studio, UNSW, 2012.

Figure 5. Bibby's place, Bonnyrigg. Photograph by the author

symbolic reference to the ancient royal place of Nineveh, in what is present-day Iraq. The entire external wall of the Nineveh Club makes visual reference to ancient Assyrian architecture: the entrance is marked by the Assyrian winged-bull (shedu lamassu) statue, with a body of a lion, the crowned head of an ancient Assyrian king and the wings of an eagle. The explicit cultural references in the architecture of Nineveh aim to affirm the community's historic continuity and credibility. To the general public, however, the symbols, being generally unfamiliar, act as a barrier to the private spaces of the club.

Far from the heart of city life and isolated from public services, the clubs that developed with government assistance in the late 1970s lacked basic connections to the communities they were meant to serve. Isolation contributed to their sole focus on their communities and weakened any urban connectedness. The large suburban blocks allowed for minimal, if any, engagement with the streetscape and apparent disregard for the urban context. Instead, in the case of many suburban community centres, the buildings' street fronts appeared to promote essentialist national qualities of the communities they represented.

Conclusion: Diverse Responses to Shifting Ground

Ghassan Hage refers to multiculturalism as an experience of "cosmopolitan consumption, in reality largely created by inter-national tourism."[62] He argues that, in contemporary Australia, multiculturalism is commonly defined by the availability of ethic restaurants for cosmopolitan consumers, rather than by any authentic contribution, or what he refers to as "migrant home building." With ethnicity seen as an object of appreciation by the cosmopolitan subject, multiculturalism, he argues, frames a class discourse.[63] "Cosmo-multiculturalism" becomes primarily a class discourse aimed at establishing a cultural distinction between cosmopolitan subjects—those consuming ethnic culture and those who contribute to it.[64]

Hage's understanding of multiculturalism lends itself to the architecture of ethnic clubs. The integration of these clubs into the city fabric relies heavily on the consumption of "ethnicity" by others. The early clubs, which were set in the inner city, engaged in city life primarily through consumption of ethnic

62. Hage, "At Home in the Entrails of the West," 99–154.

63. Hage, "At Home in the Entrails of the West," 100.

64. Hage, "At Home in the Entrails of the West," 99–154.

food and culture. As the need to cater for the expectations of the ethnic communities in question increased, the social and physical provisions offered by clubs diversified and the desire to cater for cosmopolitan consumption diminished.

Hage argues that "multiculturalism without migrants" asks migrant groups to contribute, but it asks them to moderate contentious issues or to omit them from their contribution or else risk social rejection. The changes in social roles and design strategies presented by some ethnic clubs demonstrate the gradual changes in the ways clubs engaged in public life. Some, like the Spanish and Lebanese clubs, catered for the cosmopolitan consumption; others, such as Club Marconi, promoted a parallel experience and acceptance of diversity; while others, such as Nineveh, rejected cosmopolitan and multicultural in favour of a historical claim. The changing nature of ethnic community clubs presented in this paper demonstrates the connection between built fabric and the broader political and social context. The expectation that migrant groups contribute something of their own culture is often measured against broader social demands for assimilation.