The bibliographic citation for this paper is:


Published in

All efforts have been undertaken to ensure that authors have secured appropriate permissions to reproduce the images illustrating individual contributions. Interested parties may contact the editor.

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License.
Amy Clarke, University of Queensland

Translating Scottishness from the Homeland to the Diaspora: A Consideration of Nova Scotia’s ‘Scottish’ Architectural Landscape

Nova Scotia is marketed as a region of Canada that cherishes its Scottish heritage. Settled in the seventeenth century by the Scots, French and later British, the province subsequently became a favoured destination for Scottish migrants in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. At the turn of the twentieth century large parts of Nova Scotia remained ‘Scottish’ in terms of population ethnicity and spoken language (Gaelic), and even recent census data indicates this trend continues, though somewhat diminished. ‘Scottishness’ is both a commodity and a past-time in Nova Scotia, attracting tourists and providing a point of reference for those that remain in the community year-round.

This paper will consider the translation of architectural expressions of ‘Scottishness’ from Scotland to Nova Scotia. In particular this paper will describe two key processes that have been undertaken in order to locate ‘Scottishness’ in the province’s built environment: the redefinition and identification of ‘Scottish’ architectural elements in otherwise non-Scottish historic buildings, and the appropriation of ‘Scottish’ architectural traditions with no historical precedent in Nova Scotia for modern constructions. This approach will demonstrate that Nova Scotia’s architectural ‘Scottishness’ is a translation of cultural tropes and isolated architectural elements that have been redefined in the twentieth century in order to more closely align the built identity of the province with the performed identity. In addressing this phenomenon this paper will consider whether Scottishness can be translated and understood through architecture in the diaspora, or whether attempting to do so will only achieve new and divergent meanings.
Introduction

Nova Scotia is a Canadian province that has made a past-time and a living out of its Scottish identity. Throughout the province there are Scottish-themed tourist attractions and annual events, many of the residents still claim Scottish descent, and a small percentage continue to speak the Gaelic language. The intensity with which Nova Scotia markets its Scottishness is deceptive, however, as the history of the province’s settlement reveals that the Scottish migrants, though certainly numerous, were not especially prominent except for a few decades during the nineteenth century, and once in Nova Scotia they typically assimilated quickly. Evidence of this assimilation is apparent in the eighteenth and nineteenth century architecture of the region, which shows an almost universal adoption of a timber-framed New England Georgian hybrid amongst settler communities regardless of their ethnic or cultural background. Nova Scotia might claim a Scottish past and might promote its Scottishness in the present, but this notion was not introduced until the post-war period and as such the architectural heritage of the region does not endorse this identity in the way modern Nova Scotians and tourists might expect. The ‘Scottish’ architecture that is now identified in Nova Scotia is instead the product of dilution, translation and appropriation, and is therefore a distinct style that bears only passing resemblance to the architecture of its claimed homeland.

Two key processes have been underway in Nova Scotia since the mid twentieth century that have reclaimed and/or fabricated ‘Scottish’ architectural features for the region. In order to provide architectural evidence of its Scottishness, Nova Scotia has been subject to a process of historical revisionism that has loosened and redefined the very notion of Scottish architecture, and this has allowed many structures that would otherwise have been disregarded to be labelled ‘Scottish’. At the same time, a process of appropriation can be observed in several recent constructions whereby architectural styles and features that are not historically found in Nova Scotia have been incorporated into new buildings, emphasizing the Scottishness of the products or services contained within. The Nova Scotia authorities, members of the Scottish diaspora and visitors to the region are all complicit in this perception of Scottishness in Nova Scotia’s architecture, and the underlying language of the Nova Scotian ‘Scottish’ architectural style is now widely recognised in the region. This paper will address the process of definition in Nova Scotia’s Scottish architecture by considering one of the most commonly mentioned ‘Scottish’ elements in the region, the five-sided dormer. The process of constructing Scottishness will also be demonstrated through a discussion of one of the recent Scottish-themed architectural designs, that of Glenora Distillery. By taking this dual approach the paper will examine the motivations for translating, or attempting to translate, the architectural traditions and motifs of a culture once this culture has fragmented into a diaspora.

While it is common to speak of ‘Scottish’ architecture and culture in both Scotland and the diaspora, it is necessary to pause here to acknowledge that this notion of a uniform Scottish identity does not accurately represent the differences between the Highlands and Lowlands of Scotland and their subsequent migrations. The people of these two regions historically spoke different languages (Gaelic in the Highlands, Scots and English in the Lowlands) and had contrasting social systems.
and cultural traditions, and these differences are apparent in the vernacular architecture of those regions. It is important to recognize that the concept of Scottishness that we are familiar with today is itself a revised and enhanced product that does not represent the full range of Scotland’s social, cultural and architectural traditions.\(^1\) The same is true of the attribution of the ‘Scottish’ label in Nova Scotia, as this fails to recognize that migrants often replicated the Highland/Lowland divisions in their new lives by settling with other members of their original community. While the ‘Scottish’ label is now widely used throughout Nova Scotia, there are many in the Cape Breton region, for instance, who distinguish themselves as specifically ‘Gaelic’ and see their culture as being inherently different to that of the rest of Nova Scotia’s Scottish diaspora. The ‘Scottish’ label is therefore applied throughout this paper in a loose sense for the sake of simplicity, but should be understood to encompass different sub-categories of Scottish culture and tradition.

The Scottish Diaspora in Nova Scotia: a Brief History

While there has been a discernible Scottish presence of one form or another in Nova Scotia since the first attempt was made at a Scottish colony there in 1628, the Scottish were only one of many interested parties that claimed and subsequently colonised the region. As there have been numerous detailed accounts of Nova Scotia’s settlement history that have focussed on the Scottish community, it will suffice to note here simply that the Scottish migrant community in Nova Scotia did not become especially prominent in size until the early nineteenth century, when the entire province experienced an intense period of settlement.\(^2\) The overall population of the province rose from approximately 20,000 (of which very few are thought to have been Scots) in 1776 to 523,837 in 1921, and by this stage it is known 28% of the population identified as Scottish.\(^3\) Even this high percentage of ethnically ‘Scottish’ Nova Scotians is by no means a majority, as the same census showed that 30% of Nova Scotians regarded themselves as ‘English’.\(^4\) Though it is undeniable that there was a substantial number of Scottish and Nova Scotian–Scottish residents in the province by the early twentieth century, it would be inaccurate to regard the province as having been ‘Scottish’ from the outset, particularly as the region was also home to the indigenous Mi’kmaq people. Nova Scotia may


4 “Powerful Pathos,” 159.
take its name from the seventeenth century colony ‘New Scotland’, but it was not until the twentieth century that it was widely thought of as the ‘Scottish’ province of Canada.

The impression we now have of a ‘Scottish’ Nova Scotia stems from a period in the first half of the twentieth century when economic depression and industrial decline fostered complimentary anti-modern and cultural tourism movements, both of which drew inspiration from the region’s Scottish diaspora. Several works by the historian Ian McKay provide insight into this period in Nova Scotia, and effectively demonstrate how the status of Nova Scotia’s Scottish community was elevated to prominence, transcending the previous position it had been designated as one of five ‘founding’ races of the region (alongside the English, French, Acadian, Irish and Hanoverian). It is not necessary to replicate this discourse here, save only to acknowledge that by the 1960s the Nova Scotia government was funding Scottish-themed tourism campaigns and Gaelic language initiatives, while the Nova Scotian community had begun establishing cultural associations, such as the Gaelic Foundation of Cape Breton, and campaigning for Scottish colonial cultural landmarks to be reconstructed, such as the pioneer Log Church of Loch Broom and the migrant-transportation ship, Hector, at Pictou. This process was all but complete by the 1970s, by which time the government had clearly determined that the ‘Scottish’ brand was Nova Scotia’s most unique selling-point, and parts of Nova Scotian society had found comfort in the revival of traditional Scottish customs and imagery. Gradually the Scottishness of Nova Scotia had become a widely accepted identity narrative.

Locating the Architectural ‘Scottishness’ of Pre-Twentieth Century Nova Scotia

The elevation and promotion of the Scottish identity in Nova Scotia in the twentieth century was aided by the survival of the Gaelic language and intangible cultural traditions of the diaspora, and these factors provided a layer of authenticity to what was otherwise a rather manufactured identity narrative. What Nova Scotia’s Scottish community lacked, however, was its own architectural identity, as from the mid eighteenth century the province was dominated by a timber vernacular that


7 McKay, “Tartanism Triumphant,” 16-17.
bore many similarities to the Cape Cod and New England hall and parlour forms.\(^8\) A notable but rare exception to this general trend is visible in the nineteenth century architecture of Pictou County, which shows some evidence of the influence of the Scottish masonry traditions in some (though by no means all) of its structures.\(^9\) With this exception in mind, the work of Peter Ennals, Deryck Holdsworth and others has revealed that the Nova Scotia vernacular bares few obvious or conclusive markers of the architecture of Scotland.\(^10\) Thus, while the Nova Scotia community and authorities had grown increasingly invested in the perception of their province as having a Scottish identity by the mid twentieth century, the built heritage of the province obscured this Scottishness behind a seemingly uniform Nova Scotian, or perhaps Maritime North American, collective visual identity. It is at this point that the first of the two processes of interest to this paper, the reinterpretation and retroactive identification of ‘Scottish’ architecture in Nova Scotia, became widespread.

One clear indication of this trend in locating and promoting ‘Scottish’ architecture in Nova Scotia is the frequency with which this label has been attributed to architecture by modern Nova Scotian historians, heritage practitioners and archivists. There have been several publications of Nova Scotian origin over the past thirty years that have provided descriptions of Nova Scotia’s ‘Scottish’ architecture, whilst the Nova Scotia government has given heritage designation to several ‘Scottish’ structures.\(^11\) Since the 1970s the Highland Village Museum has been exhibiting examples of ‘Scottish’ and ‘Nova Scotia-Scottish’ architectural forms, and in more recent times walking tours and digital exhibitions of the ‘Scottish’ architecture of Pictou and Antigonish counties have been released by

---


regional authorities.12 It is clear that there is a widely held belief within Nova Scotia that the region's architecture includes a discernible 'Scottish' subcategory, and this appears to be founded on the recurrence of a small number of architectural elements that have Scottish associations. This focus on elements is necessary, one could argue, as there are no examples of complete structures of a purely Scottish architectural style in Nova Scotia. The process of identification relies on a loose definition of Scottishness that is sufficiently indicated by features and fragments, even if the remainder of the structure is decidedly non-Scottish.

The popularity of the five-sided dormer element amongst historians who have discussed Nova Scotia's Scottish architecture provides a clear example of this method of attributing identity, so it will be discussed here in order to better understand the broader process. In Nova Scotia the five-sided dormer, referred to by some as the 'Scottish dormer', is often described as being ‘typically’ Scottish and its inclusion in an eighteenth or nineteenth century dwelling is seen as a strong indication of the building's original owners having had Scottish ancestry.13 These dormers can be seen in the rare examples of neoclassical stone townhouses in Pictou (fig. 1) and Halifax, as well as in numerous timber structures throughout Nova Scotia (fig. 2). It is unclear when the association of Scottishness with this variety of dormer first appeared in the work of Nova Scotian historians, though one of the earliest architectural heritage publications that dealt with the region, Wood and Stone (1972), confidently described the dormer as being generically ‘Scottish’.14 A survey of numerous publications of this period and more recent times has failed to reveal the origins of the five-sided dormer in Nova Scotia, and it has also been difficult to determine why the authors of these publications regard the dormer as ‘Scottish’ in the first place. It is entirely possible that consensus has grown over time as more and more publications have repeated the attribution of Scottishness, even though the history of this element in the region remains uncertain.

While it is true that the five-sided dormer was used in Scotland, and was popular in Aberdeenshire in the late nineteenth century, the generalization that Nova Scotian historians have made of this element being ‘Scottish’ is rather inaccurate.15 It is one of many varieties of dormer that were employed in Scotland, and it was also included in other architectural traditions – a five-sided dormer element was used by the predominately German settlers of the Nova Scotian town of Lunenburg in

14 Pictou Heritage Society, Wood and Stone, 2, 10, 26, 30.
the nineteenth century, for instance. Moreover, as Allen Penney noted in 1989, this style of dormer was often retroactively added to existing structures in Nova Scotia, and should not be relied upon as a conclusive indication of the ‘Scottishness’ of the building’s original occupants. Similar critiques could be made of the other ‘Scottish’ architectural elements identified by historians in Nova Scotia, such as the gable-end chimneys and the application of neoclassical symmetry and simplicity to façades (the latter viewed as particularly ‘Scottish’ when built in stone rather than timber).

As with the five-sided dormers, these features might have been used in parts of Scotland during parts of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, but are by no means unique to Scotland. Once these elements are translated into timber, as has consistently been the case in Nova Scotia, it

---

18 Pictou Heritage Society, Wood and Stone, 2; Penney, Houses of Nova Scotia, 54; Virtual Museum Canada and Hector Exhibit Centre, “Urban and Rural Pictou.”
becomes even more problematic to think of them as being ‘Scottish’, as historically the use of timber in this way in Scotland was essentially non-existent.\(^{\text{19}}\)

The architectural heritage and style that Nova Scotian historians and heritage practitioners have identified as Scottish would, we can argue, more appropriately be thought of as a hybrid that drew on some of the motifs and ideas used (though not exclusively) in Scotland during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. These elements were then merged by the settlers of Nova Scotia with those of other styles and traditions, and given a new mode of expression through the timber vernacular. It would seem, therefore, that Nova Scotia’s ‘Scottish’ architecture is in fact unique to Nova Scotia, or perhaps to the slightly broader Maritime region of Canada, and is indicative of the natural progression of architectural ideas in a settler society exposed to new materials and traditions. While some texts acknowledge a distinct Nova Scotian architectural style, the attachment to ‘Scottish’ architectural features that is evident even in more recent publications can be seen as indicative of the desire to locate a Scottish built history for the province that reinforces the Scottish cultural identity being performed and promoted in Nova Scotia.

**Incorporating Scottishness into Nova Scotia’s Modern Architecture**

The interpretation and attribution of Scottishness in Nova Scotia’s architectural heritage is not the only way that a Scottish identity has been imposed in the province’s built environment in the latter half of the twentieth century. From the 1970s onwards, the Scottish identity in Nova Scotia has been supported by new or drastically renovated sites such as the McCulloch House Museum (home of nineteenth century Scottish minister Thomas McCulloch, opened to the public in the 1970s); the Gaelic College of Arts and Crafts (founded in 1939 but greatly expanded in 1974) and the Hector Heritage Quay and replica ship *Hector* (initiated in the 1970s and completed in 2000) amongst others.\(^{\text{20}}\) While much could be said about the broad trend in Scottish cultural heritage tourism in Nova Scotia over the past forty years, attention will be focussed here on one instance of a modern construction that has incorporated ‘Scottish’ motifs into its design. This process serves as a further indication of the previously discussed efforts to locate Scottishness in Nova Scotia’s built environment, though this time the architecture in question – the Glenora Distillery complex – is modern rather than historic.

The Glenora Distillery is a significant ‘Scottish’ site in Nova Scotia for several reasons, some more apparent than others. Founded in the 1980s by a Nova Scotian, Bruce Jardine, the Distillery was the subject of a prolonged period of legal action instigated by the Scotch Whisky Association (SWA).\(^{\text{21}}\) The Distillery, it was contended by the SWA, was intentionally misleading customers by adopting

---


the name ‘Glenora’ and applying this brand to a single-malt whisky, giving the impression that the Distillery’s products were of Scottish, rather than Canadian, origin.22 This allegation was eventually dismissed after several stages of appeal in 2009, and Glenora Distillery was allowed to continue using its brand.23 This period in the Distillery’s history is noted here, as in order to continue using its brand the Distillery had to prove that it was not attempting to dupe customers into believing their product was Scottish, whilst simultaneously justifying their right to use a name, manufacturing tradition and brand identity that were clearly of strong Scottish influence. As the Distillery was legally obliged to refrain from calling their product ‘Scotch’ (as it was not distilled in Scotland), it can therefore be argued that the visual and cultural identity of the business, including its architecture, became the primary vehicle for establishing and promoting Scottishness.

The Glenora Distillery alludes to its Scottishness in a number of ways. In various press interviews and corporate materials the Distillery has acknowledged the Scottish migrants who settled the local area, Glenville, in the 1820s, and it has also publicized the Scottish ancestry of the Distillery’s staff and local clientele.24 This narrative is also recounted to visitors of the Distillery, who are given a tour that includes an historical exhibit which provides information on the whisky distillation process, the history of whisky production in Scotland, and the emergence of the Scottish diaspora in Nova Scotia (refer fig. 3).

While much could be said about these elements of the Distillery’s identity, it is the architecture that is of most interest to the present study, and it too makes clear claims of Scottishness. The Distillery complex, which includes several processing and storage buildings, as well as a restaurant (fig. 4),

Fig. 3: The Glenora Distillery provides visitors with a history of whisky distillation through its guided tour and historical exhibit, as this section of an interpretive panel shows. Note that the term ‘Scotch’ is used here and the history emphasises the product’s Scottish origins. Photograph by Amy Clarke, 2012

---

corporate hospitality spaces and a small hotel, was designed with the assistance of the Scottish architect David Forsyth. Unlike much of Nova Scotia’s architecture, the Distillery’s exterior walls are of stone construction and are white-washed in a manner not dissimilar to that which is seen in regions of Scotland. The Distillery’s pagoda roof element (fig. 5) is also a common feature of Scottish distilleries, and it sits atop one of the main processing rooms which houses imported Scottish equipment that was installed by a Scottish distillation expert (fig. 6). These design inclusions are by no means casual or accidental, as the distillery openly acknowledges that its architecture has imitated Scottish traditions in order to achieve a likeness to the distilleries in Scotland.

Glenora Distillery’s appropriation of a Scottish architectural form that has no historical precedents in Nova Scotia is partly indicative of a desire to produce a high-quality product using the proven methods of Scottish manufacturers, but it also serves to advertise the ‘Scottish’ nature of the whisky produced within.
The Distillery’s physical appearance makes a claim for the authenticity of its product and processes, as well as, one could argue, the Scottish ancestry of its owners and local community. While there are clear financial motivations for the Distillery to be promoted and perceived as ‘Scottish’, the Scottish diaspora throughout Nova Scotia also benefits from the success of this brand. The Distillery’s physical presence in the landscape, as well as in bars and restaurants across the globe, provides a further reminder of the Scottishness of Nova Scotia.

Conclusion

There is much more to be gleaned from the narrative of Scottishness in Nova Scotia’s architecture, and the way this narrative is interacted with and interpreted. This paper has described two central processes that have aided the attribution of ‘Scottishness’, and in doing so has revealed the underlying motivations for making Scottishness visible in Nova Scotia’s built environment. There remain many avenues for further exploration, such as the differences (if any) that exist between generic ‘Scottish’ and specifically ‘Gaelic’ architectural forms in Nova Scotia; the similarities (if any) that exist between Nova Scotia’s ‘Scottish’ architecture and that of other parts of the Scottish diaspora within Canada, and the comparison of the Scottish diaspora’s architectural experiences in Nova Scotia with that of other diasporas. What is clear from the present study is that architectural Scottishness has become a commodity in Nova Scotia, a product that can be consumed by tourists and engaged with by locals. This architecture, however historically inaccurate or inauthentic, brings a depth of experience to the Scottish narrative of Nova Scotia and for this reason alone is likely to persist for some time to come.